Movement Encounters in Black and White: Understanding Issues of Race and Cultural Competency in Dance/Movement Therapy.

A Thesis
Submitted to the Faculty
of
The Creative Arts in Therapy Program
Drexel University
by
Lysa Monique Jenkins-Hayden
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree
of
Master of Arts
And Dance/Movement Therapy
June 2011
Dedications

I dedicate my thesis work to my family for their support and unending endurance in hearing me repeatedly say “after thesis is done then we can….”. A special thanks to my mother for all her support, love, and patience, and my brother Tracy for his listening ear. To the field of dance/movement therapy that has given me tools to understand myself and others better and hopefully through this work I have given something back. To my sisters, Vicky and Melody, who have died during my college years, much of what they have taught me was perseverance even through what seems insurmountable, and that knowledge carried me through this process even without their physical presence. To all the ancestors who had to endure some of the horrific encounters about which I write in this work, on their shoulders I stand. To both my grandmothers, Ernestine & Julia, thanks for passing on the passion to dance through life. I carry on the dance on earth while you watch from beyond.
Acknowledgements

I would like to recognize the members of my committee: Sharon Goodill, Ph.D., BC-DMT, NCC, LPC, Meg H. Chang, Ed.D, LCAT, NCC, BC-DMT thank you for providing me the professional guidance and encouragement to complete this process; and Stephanie Brooks, Ph.D., LCSW, LMFT thank you for going beyond your professional role and providing me a model of perseverance and a place to check my reality and sanity in your image and experiences during my long years of study at Drexel. To my dear friend and colleague, Tony N. Brown, Ph.D., thank you for providing me with an image and model for completing an advance degree, and for giving me the courage and support to understand that my work was important to my field and others.
1. INTRODUCTION

OPERATIONAL DEFINITIONS AND KEY CONCEPTS

Body Image ................................................................. 6
Nonverbal Communication ........................................... 6
Multicultural Competence ............................................. 6
Whites and Blacks ....................................................... 6
Culture / Cultural Identity ............................................. 7
Racial Identity ............................................................. 8
Racialization ............................................................... 9
Structural racism/racialization ......................................... 9
Racial Microaggressions ................................................. 9
Acculturation / Assimilation ......................................... 10
Therapist/Therapy Professions ...................................... 10
Cross Racial/Cultural Relationship ..................................... 10

2. LITERATURE REVIEW ....................................................... 11

2.1 BODY IMAGE ............................................................. 11

2.1.1. Body Image Definitions, Functions, and Formation ................. 11

2.1.1.1. Body Image Definitions ......................................... 11
2.1.1.2. Body Image Functions .......................................... 11
2.1.1.3. Body Image Development and Formation ......................... 12

2.1.2. Body and Body Image Relationship .................................. 14

2.1.2.1. The Body/Mind Relationship ................................... 14
2.1.2.2. Body and Body Image Relationship ............................ 15
2.1.3. Influences on Body Image

2.1.3.1. Beauty, Attractiveness and Body Image

2.1.3.2. Relational, Societal, and Interactional Influences on Body Image

2.1.3.3. Cultural Influences on Body Image

2.1.3.4. Acculturation and Body Image

2.1.3.5. Body Image Ideals in Black and White

2.1.4. Body Image and The Self

2.1.4.1. Body, Body Image, The Self, and Identity

2.1.4.2. The Body, Body Image, Personality, and Character

2.1.5. Body Image Health, Disturbance, and Change

2.1.5.1. The Body, Body Image, and Health

2.1.5.2. The Body, Body Image, and Disturbance

2.2. NONVERBAL COMMUNICATIONS

2.2.1. DEFINITION AND MEASUREMENT OF NONVERBAL COMMUNICATIONS

2.2.2. The Body, The Self, and Nonverbal Communications

2.2.2.1. Defining Nonverbal Communications, The Body, and Body Movement Relationship

2.2.2.2. Nonverbal Communications, Body Image, and The Self

2.2.2.3. The Function and Purpose of Nonverbal Communications

2.2.2.4. The Development of Nonverbal Communications

2.2.3. Influences on Nonverbal Communications

2.2.3.1. Beauty, Attractiveness and Nonverbal Communications

2.2.3.2. Nonverbal Communications and The Other: Relational and Interactional Influences

2.2.3.3. Cultural and Socioeconomic Influences on Nonverbal Communications

2.2.3.4. The State of Nonverbal Communication Research on African Americans

2.2.3.5. Nonverbal Communications in Black and White
2.2.3.6. Acculturation and Nonverbal Communications

2.3. MULTICULTURAL COUNSELING COMPETENCIES (MCC)

2.3.1. Defining Multiculturalism and Multicultural Counseling

2.3.2. History, Call for Standards, and Competency Framework

2.3.3. The Rationale for Cultural Competence

2.3.3.1. The Culturally Competent Counselor

Therapeutic Alliance

2.3.3.3. Culture, Cultural Identity, and Cross-Cultural Competence

Cultural Identity Development

2.3.3.6. Understanding the Importance of Racial Identity Development

2.3.3.7. What does Racial Identity Development and Investigation Entail?

2.3.3.8. Racial Identity Models (RIM) and Implications for Culturally Competent Practice

2.3.3.9. Racial-Ethnic Matching

2.3.4. Relevance of Societal Impact on Therapy Relationship

2.3.5. African American History and Social Experiences

2.3.5.1. Slavery

2.3.5.2. Racial Etiquettes

2.3.5.3. Effects of the Caste System on White and Black Behavior and Personality

2.3.5.4. Interactional and Dynamic Patterns within American Society

2.3.5.5. Potential Residual Impact of Slavery, Racism, and Oppression

2.3.5.5.1. Intergenerational Theory

2.3.5.5.2. Post Traumatic Slave Syndrome

2.3.5.5.3. Slavery’s Influence on African Spirits, Minds and Bodies

2.3.5.5.3. Whipping and Other Punishment

2.3.6. Racism
2.4.5. Dance Influences on DMT ......................................................................................... 161
2.4.5.1. Black Americans and Dance ............................................................................. 161
2.4.6. The Significance of the Nonverbal in Dance/Movement Therapy ....................... 165
2.4.7. Body Image and Cultural Self in DMT ................................................................... 166
2.4.8. Dance Movement Therapy Research on Black Americans .................................. 169

3. METHODOLOGY ........................................................................................................... 183

3.1. DESIGN ....................................................................................................................... 183
3.3. INCLUSION/EXCLUSION CRITERIA ......................................................................... 185
3.4. PROCEDURES ............................................................................................................. 187
3.5. REFLEXIVITY STATEMENT ...................................................................................... 187

4. RESULTS ....................................................................................................................... 190

4.1. RESULTS OF CODING ............................................................................................. 190
4.2. RESULTS OF CODE CLUSTERING .......................................................................... 228
4.3. CODE CATEGORY DESCRIPTIONS ........................................................................... 230
4.5. RESULTS OF INTERCONNECTING THE CATEGORIES .............................................. 233
4.6. THE CORE CATEGORY AND THEORETICAL MODEL ............................................ 237
4.7. THE STORY GENERATED FROM THE RESULTS OF DATA ANALYSIS ................ 238
4.8. DISCursive SET OF THEORETICAL PROPOSITIONS ............................................ 240

5. DISCUSSION ................................................................................................................ 242

5.1. OVERVIEW ................................................................................................................. 242
5.2. LITERATURE APPLICATIONS CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS .................................. 243
5.3. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY .................................................................................. 262
5.4. IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH ....................................................... 264
6. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ........................................................................................................ 266

7. REFERENCES ............................................................................................................................... 267

8. APPENDICES .............................................................................................................................. 294

APPENDIX A: AMCD MULTICULTURAL COUNSELING COMPETENCIES .................................................. 295

APPENDIX B: AMERICAN HISTORY TIMELINE – SIGNIFICANT BLACK/WHITE RELATIONS ....................... 299

APPENDIX C: AFRICAN/BLACK PSYCHOLOGY VS EUROPEAN/WESTERN PSYCHOLOGY ......................... 306

APPENDIX D: BLACK RACIAL IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT MODEL .......................................................... 308

APPENDIX E: EXAMPLES OF EUROPEAN WORLDVIEW IN AMERICAN SOCIETY ................................. 310

APPENDIX F: HELM’S WHITE RACIAL IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT MODEL .............................................. 311

APPENDIX G: REFLEXIVITY STATEMENT ........................................................................................... 313
ABSTRACT

Movement Encounters in Black and White: Understanding Issues of Race and Cultural Competency in Dance/Movement Therapy.

Lysa Monique Jenkins-Hayden, MA, R-DMT

The objective of this study was to examine and cross reference literature, across related fields of study, and assist in generating hypotheses for understanding the Black client/White therapist relationship as it may be experienced and expressed nonverbally. This literature based study involved a review and qualitative analysis of literature in several topic areas and from a number of professional fields, in order to discover associations between the various literatures. The data were analyzed using grounded theory methodology as outlined by Boyatzis (1998) & Creswell (1988). Literature data was gathered from four major discipline categories, body image, nonverbal communications, multicultural competence (inclusive of sociology, psychology, family therapy, black psychology) and dance/movement therapy (DMT). Themes were identified and coded into 24 codes and then clustered according to related characteristics into 6 larger categories. The 6 categories were analyzed to determine any causal and developmental hierarchy between the themes. Finally, eight theoretical propositions were concluded and discussed with clinical implications for DMT practice with Black clients.

As this study was theoretical and not empirical, its theoretical conclusions are preliminary work towards: a) introducing race and ethnic considerations into the theory, practice, and research of DMT; b) operationalization the multicultural competencies for DMT practitioners; and c) introducing the scholarly lexicon and theory of Sociology and Black Psychology in order to improve effectiveness with Black clients in the DMT setting. Although Critical Race Theory (CRT) was not used for analysis, the conclusions of the study were consistent with the major assertions of CRT.
1. INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study was to develop standards and protocols that may guide culturally competent practice in dance/movement therapy, specifically within the Black client/White therapist therapeutic movement relationship. This literature based study will apply grounded theory methods to a review of nonverbal communication, dance/movement therapy, body image, and multicultural competency literatures that address Blacks and Whites in the United States and their social interactions.

The objective was to examine and cross reference literature, across related fields of study, to generate theoretical hypotheses for understanding the Black client/White therapist relationship as it may be experienced and expressed nonverbally. It is expected that the study will raise awareness, support dialogue, and provide guidance for operationalizing multicultural competence standards for dance/movement therapy (DMT), especially when working with Black clients. The research question is “What is the nature of a culturally sensitive and competent Black client/White therapist cross-racial/cultural movement relationship?"

Concerns regarding problems in cross-cultural therapy in the United States first prompted a call to recognize a need to develop guidelines in the 1970’s. Discussion that addressed cultural diversity and cross racial/cultural therapy practice emerged to define multicultural competence, to identify cross-cultural competencies, and to suggest ethical standards.

Sue, Bernier, Durrant, Feinberg, Pedersen, Smith &Vasquez-Nuttal (1982) introduced 11 cross-cultural competencies divided into three categories: beliefs and attitudes, knowledge, and skills. This work has provided the foundation for further investigations into multicultural competence over the past two decades (Ridley & Kleiner, 2003). In 1992, Sue, Arredondo, & McDavis published an official call to implement multicultural counseling competencies into ethical codes to guide counseling practice and standard educational requirements in order to better serve minority populations.

Arredondo, Toporek, Brown, Jones, Locke, Sanchez, & Stadler (1996) followed these authors and operationalized the counseling competencies previously offered by Sue and colleagues (included in Appendix A). Of unique note, what Arredondo and team proposed, was the critical understanding of how dimensions of personal identity affected individual differences and shared groups identities, as well as how power/privilege, oppression/limitation, and normality/health is assigned or defined based on various identity dimensions. These authors stimulated awareness as to how consideration of these concepts was vital to the therapeutic process. Namely, if therapists were to effectively understand their social impact on...
clients, they would need to acknowledge, for example, that their communications style was developed within a cultural context and how it might clash with a racially, ethnically, or culturally dissimilar client.

Historically, concerns about barriers to therapeutic effectiveness when working with minority populations were outlined, by various authors mainly in the field of counseling psychology (Ridley & Kleiner, 2003). They continue to be discussed in current literature across various counseling professions.

The American Psychological Association (APA), in 1993; and the American Counseling Association (ACA), in 1995, both revised their codes of ethics to include statements supporting cross-cultural approaches and condemning discriminatory practices (Sue et. al, 1998). However, while multicultural counseling competencies (MCC) have gained a significant position in many therapy professions, the process of implementation has been slow in pace, especially in understanding how sociopolitical dynamics (e.g., racism, oppression, discrimination, etc.) affect the counseling process, training programs, and the field of psychology in general (Liu & Pope-Davis, 2003).

This literature based study seems timely as it coincides with recent increased attention to diversity issues in the dance/movement therapy (DMT) profession. The American Dance Therapy Association (ADTA) recently added a nondiscrimination clause to its ethics standards (2008), hosted a national conference on Dance/Movement Therapy in a Diverse Society (2008), and initiated a Board of Directors ad hoc committee to investigate diversity barriers within the organization and profession (2008). The dance/movement therapy (DMT) literature that currently exists in the area of diversity or cultural competence, is a growing but limited body of scholarship that primarily addresses Black Americans (Alexander, 1995; Cherry, 1998; Crapps, 1990; Fountaine, 1982; Harmon, 1994; Saint James, 2006); cultural concerns in practice (Boas, 2006; Chang, 2006; Farr, 1997; Pallaro, 1997), movement observation (Moore & Yamamoto, 1988; Tepayayone, 2004), and several master’s theses which address culture specific practice models (Davis, 1993; James, 2006; Madrigal, 2002). The DMT literature has developed largely without reference to the broader, foundational or recent body of MCC literature burgeoning in family therapy, counseling, and psychology in the past ten years. At the same time, there exists a gap in the overall MCC literature, as it is written primarily for therapists who use a verbal medium. For the purpose of this study, the researcher has elected to review body image and nonverbal communication literatures, commonly referenced within DMT, in relation to literature addressing the therapeutic movement relationship and multicultural counseling literature to assist in understanding the cross racial/cultural DMT relationship.