Movement Encounters in Black and White: Understanding Issues of Race and Cultural Competency in Dance/Movement Therapy.

A Thesis

Submitted to the Faculty

of

The Creative Arts in Therapy Program

Drexel University

by

Lysa Monique Jenkins-Hayden in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

of

Master of Arts

And Dance/Movement Therapy

June 2011

© Copyright 2011 Lysa Monique Jenkins-Hayden. All Rights Reserved.

Dedications

I dedicate my thesis work to my family for their support and unending endurance in hearing me repeatedly say "after thesis is done then we can....". A special thanks to my mother for all her support, love, and patience, and my brother Tracy for his listening ear. To the field of dance/movement therapy that has given me tools to understand myself and others better and hopefully through this work I have given something back. To my sisters, Vicky and Melody, who have died during my college years, much of what they have taught me was perseverance even through what seems insurmountable, and that knowledge carried me through this process even without their physical presence. To all the ancestors who had to endure some of the horrific encounters about which I write in this work, on their shoulders I stand. To both my grandmothers, Ernestine & Julia, thanks for passing on the passion to dance through life. I carry on the dance on earth while you watch from beyond.

Acknowledgements

I would like to recognize the members of my committee: Sharon Goodill, Ph.D.,BC-DMT, NCC, LPC, Meg H. Chang, Ed.D, LCAT, NCC, BC-DMT thank you for providing me the professional guidance and encouragement to complete this process; and Stephanie Brooks, Ph.D., LCSW, LMFT thank you for going beyond your professional role and providing me a model of perseverance and a place to check my reality and sanity in your image and experiences during my long years of study at Drexel. To my dear friend and colleague, Tony N. Brown, Ph.D., thank you for providing me with an image and model for completing an advance degree, and for giving me the courage and support to understand that my work was important to my field and others.

1.	. INTRODUCTION	1
	OPERATIONAL DEFINITIONS AND KEY CONCEPTS	6
	Body Image	6
	Nonverbal Communication	6
	Multicultural Competence	6
	Whites and Blacks	6
	Culture / Cultural Identity	7
	Racial Identity	8
	Racialization	9
	Structural racism/racialization	9
	Racial Microaggressions	9
	Acculturation / Assimilation	10
	Therapist/Therapy Professions	10
	Cross Racial/Cultural Relationship	10
2.	LITERATURE REVIEW	11
	2.1 BODY IMAGE	11
	2.1.1. Body Image Definitions, Functions, and Formation	11
	2.1.1.1. Body Image Definitions	11
	2.1.1.2. Body Image Functions	11
	2.1.1.3. Body Image Development and Formation	12
	2.1.2. Body and Body Image Relationship	14
	2.1.2.1. The Body/Mind Relationship	
	2.1.2.2. Body and Body Image Relationship	15

2.1.2.3. Body Image and Body Movement Relationship	16
2.1.3. Influences on Body Image	16
2.1.3.1. Beauty, Attractiveness and Body Image	16
2.1.3.2. Relational, Societal, and Interactional Influences on Body Image	18
2.1.3.3. Cultural Influences on Body Image	20
2.1.3.4. Acculturation and Body Image	21
2.1.3.5. Body Image Ideals in Black and White	22
2.1.4. Body Image and The Self	26
2.1.4.1. Body, Body Image, The Self, and Identity	26
2.1.4.2. The Body, Body Image, Personality, and Character	27
2.1.5. Body Image Health, Disturbance, and Change	27
2.1.5.1. The Body, Body Image, and Health	27
2.1.5.2. The Body, Body Image, and Disturbance	28
2.2. NONVERBAL COMMUNICATIONS	31
2.2.1. DEFINITION AND MEASUREMENT OF NONVERBAL COMMUNICATIONS	31
2.2.2. The Body, The Self, and Nonverbal Communications	31
2.2.2.1. Defining Nonverbal Communications, The Body, and Body Movement Relationship	31
2.2.2.2. Nonverbal Communications, Body Image, and The Self	32
2.2.2.3. The Function and Purpose of Nonverbal Communications	33
2.2.2.4. The Development of Nonverbal Communications	33
2.2.3. Influences on Nonverbal Communications	35
2.2.3.1. Beauty, Attractiveness and Nonverbal Communications	35
2.2.3.1. Nonverbal Communications and The Other: Relational and Interactional Influences	36
2.2.3.3. Cultural and Socioeconomic Influences on Nonverbal Communications	37
2.2.3.5. The State of Nonverbal Communication Research on African Americans	38
2.2.3.5. Nonverbal Communications in Black and White	38

2.2.3.6. Acculturation and Nonverbal Communications	40
2.3. MULTICULTURAL COUNSELING COMPETENCIES (MCC)	42
2.3.1. Defining Multiculturism and Multicultural Counseling	42
2.3.2. History, Call for Standards, and Competency Framework	44
2.3.3. The Rationale for Cultural Competence	48
2.3.3.1. The Culturally Competent Counselor	52
Therapeutic Alliance	53
2.3.3.3. Culture, Cultural Identity, and Cross-Cultural Competence	57
Cultural Identity Development	60
2.3.3.5. Ethnic Identity	63
2.3.3.6. Understanding the Importance of Racial Identity Development	65
2.3.3.7. What does Racial Identity Development and Investigation Entail?	66
2.3.3.8. Racial Identity Models (RIM) and Implications for Culturally Competent Practice	68
2.3.3.9. Racial-Ethnic Matching	71
2.3.4. Relevance of Societal Impact on Therapy Relationship	72
2.3.5. African American History and Social Experiences	72
2.3.5.1. Slavery	72
2.3.5.2. Racial Etiquettes	74
2.3.5.3. Effects of the Caste System on White and Black Behavior and Personality	83
2.3.5.4. Interactional and Dynamic Patterns within American Society	87
2.3.5.5. Potential Residual Impact of Slavery, Racism, and Oppression	89
2.3.5.5.1. Intergenerational Theory	89
2.3.5.5.2. Post Traumatic Slave Syndrome	91
2.3.5.5.3. Slavery's Influence on African Spirits, Minds and Bodies	93
2.3.5.5.3.3. Whipping and Other Punishment	95
2.3.6. Racism	105

2.3.6.1. Application of Interactional Patterns within American Society to Creative Arts Therapy	109
2.3.7. Dynamics in the Cross Cultural White Therapist/Black Client Relationship	111
2.3.7.1. History of African Americans and Mental Health	113
2.3.7.1.1. Race, Racism, Research and Therapy	113
2.3.7.1.2. The Metaphors of Race and Racism	117
2.3.7.1.2. Black American Attitudes Concerning Mental Health	119
2.3.7.1.3. Power Dynamics between Black and Whites	124
2.3.7.1.3. African/Black Psychology	127
2.3.7.1.4. Black Identity Development	129
2.3.7.1.5. Racial Socialization and Racialization	137
2.3.7.2. White Culture and White Identity	138
2.3.7.2.1. Who is White? and What is White Culture?	138
2.3.7.2.2. White Privilege	142
2.3.7.2.3. White Racial Identity Development (WRID)	145
2.4. DANCE MOVEMENT THERAPY	149
2.4.1. Defining Dance Movement Therapy and Its Basic Assumptions	149
2.4.2. The Body and DMT	149
2.4.3. DMT Process and Techniques	150
2.4.3.1. DMT Therapeutic Relationship and Influences from Other Fields	150
2.4.3.2. The Dance/Movement Therapeutic Relationship as Process and Technique	152
2.4.3.3. The Use of Metaphor and Symbolism	154
2.4.3.4. The Use of Empathic Reflection	154
2.4.3.4. Somatic Countertransference	156
2.4.3.5. Authentic Movement	157
2.4.3.6. The Role of Movement Observation	158
2.4.4. Racial, Ethnic, and Socio-Cultural Influences on DMT	160

	2.4.5. Dance Influences on DMT	161
	2.4.5.1. Black Americans and Dance	161
	2.4.6. The Significance of the Nonverbal in Dance/Movement Therapy	165
	2.4.7. Body Image and Cultural Self in DMT	166
	2.4.8. Dance Movement Therapy Research on Black Americans	169
3.	. METHODOLOGY	183
	3.1. DESIGN	183
	3.3. Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria	185
	3.4. PROCEDURES	187
	3.5. Reflexivity Statement	187
4.	. RESULTS	190
	4.1. RESULTS OF CODING	190
	4.2. RESULTS OF CODE CLUSTERING	228
	4.3. CODE CATEGORY DESCRIPTIONS	230
	4.5. RESULTS OF INTERCONNECTING THE CATEGORIES	233
	4.6. THE CORE CATEGORY AND THEORETICAL MODEL	237
	4.7. THE STORY GENERATED FROM THE RESULTS OF DATA ANALYSIS	238
	4.8. DISCURSIVE SET OF THEORETICAL PROPOSITIONS	240
5.	. DISCUSSION	242
	5.1. Overview	242
	5.2. LITERATURE APPLICATIONS CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS	243
	5.3. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	262
	5.4. IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	264

6.	. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	266
7.	. REFERENCES	267
8.	. APPENDICES	294
	APPENDIX A: AMCD MULTICULTURAL COUNSELING COMPETENCIES	295
	APPENDIX B: AMERICAN HISTORY TIMELINE – SIGNIFICANT BLACK/WHITE RELATIONS	299
	APPENDIX C: AFRICAN/BLACK PSYCHOLOGY VS EUROPEAN/WESTERN PSYCHOLOGY	306
	APPENDIX D: BLACK RACIAL IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT MODEL	308
	APPENDIX E: EXAMPLES OF EUROPEAN WORLDVIEW IN AMERICAN SOCIETY	310
	APPENDIX F: HELM'S WHITE RACIAL IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT MODEL	311
	Appendix G: Reflexivity Statement	313

ABSTRACT

Movement Encounters in Black and White: Understanding Issues of Race and Cultural Competency in Dance/Movement Therapy.

Lysa Monique Jenkins-Hayden, MA, R-DMT

The objective of this study was to examine and cross reference literature, across related fields of study, and assist in generating hypotheses for understanding the Black client/White therapist relationship as it may be experienced and expressed nonverbally. This literature based study involved a review and qualitative analysis of literature in several topic areas and from a number of professional fields, in order to discover associations between the various literatures. The data were analyzed using grounded theory methodology as outlined by Boyatzis (1998) & Creswell (1988). Literature data was gathered from four major discipline categories, body image, nonverbal communications, multicultural competence (inclusive of sociology, psychology, family therapy, black psychology) and dance/movement therapy (DMT). Themes were identified and coded into 24 codes and then clustered according to related characteristics into 6 larger categories. The 6 categories were analyzed to determine any causal and developmental hierarchy between the themes. Finally, eight theoretical propositions were concluded and discussed with clinical implications for DMT practice with Black clients.

As this study was theoretical and not empirical, its theoretical conclusions are preliminary work towards: a) introducing race and ethnic considerations into the theory, practice, and research of DMT; b) operationalization the multicultural competencies for DMT practitioners; and c) introducing the scholarly lexicon and theory of Sociology and Black Psychology in order to improve effectiveness with Black clients in the DMT setting. Although Critical Race Theory (CRT) was not used for analysis, the conclusions of the study were consistent with the major assertions of CRT.

1. INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study was to develop standards and protocols that may guide culturally competent practice in dance/movement therapy, specifically within the Black client/White therapist therapeutic movement relationship. This literature based study will apply grounded theory methods to a review of nonverbal communication, dance/movement therapy, body image, and multicultural competency literatures that address Blacks and Whites in the United States and their social interactions.

The objective was to examine and cross reference literature, across related fields of study, to generate theoretical hypotheses for understanding the Black client/White therapist relationship as it may be experienced and expressed nonverbally. It is expected that the study will raise awareness, support dialogue, and provide guidance for operationalizing multicultural competence standards for dance/movement therapy (DMT), especially when working with Black clients. The research question is "What is the nature of a culturally sensitive and competent Black client/White therapist cross-racial/cultural movement relationship?"

Concerns regarding problems in cross-cultural therapy in the United States first prompted a call to recognize a need to develop guidelines in the 1970's. Discussion that addressed cultural diversity and cross racial/cultural therapy practice emerged to define multicultural competence, to identify cross-cultural competencies, and to suggest ethical standards

Sue, Bernier, Durran, Feinberg, Pedersen, Smith &Vasquez-Nuttal (1982) introduced 11 cross-cultural competencies divided into three categories: beliefs and attitudes, knowledge, and skills. This work has provided the foundation for further investigations into multicultural competence over the past two decades (Ridley & Kleiner, 2003). In 1992, Sue, Arredondo, & McDavis published an official call to implement multicultural counseling competencies into ethical codes to guide counseling practice and standard educational requirements in order to better serve minority populations.

Arredondo, Toporek, Brown, Jones, Locke, Sanchez, & Stadler (1996) followed these authors and operationalized the counseling competencies previously offered by Sue and colleagues (included in Appendix A). Of unique note, what Arredondo and team proposed, was the critical understanding of how dimensions of personal identity affected individual differences and shared groups identities, as well as how power/privilege, oppression/limitation, and normality/health is assigned or defined based on various identity dimensions. These authors stimulated awareness as to how consideration of these concepts was vital to the therapeutic process. Namely, if therapists were to effectively understand their social impact on

clients, they would need to acknowledge, for example, that their communications style was developed within a cultural context and how it might clash with a racially, ethnically, or culturally dissimilar client.

Historically, concerns about barriers to therapeutic effectiveness when working with minority populations were outlined, by various authors mainly in the field of counseling psychology (Ridley & Kleiner, 2003). They continue to be discussed in current literature across various counseling professions.

The American Psychological Association (APA), in 1993; and the American Counseling Association (ACA), in 1995, both revised their codes of ethics to include statements supporting cross-cultural approaches and condemning discriminatory practices (Sue et. al, 1998). However, while multicultural counseling competencies (MCC) have gained a significant position in many therapy professions, the process of implementation has been slow in pace, especially in understanding how sociopolitical dynamics (e.g., racism, oppression, discrimination, etc.) affect the counseling process, training programs, and the field of psychology in general (Liu & Pope-Davis, 2003).

This literature based study seems timely as it coincides with recent increased attention to diversity issues in the dance/movement therapy (DMT) profession. The American Dance Therapy Association (ADTA) recently added a nondiscrimination clause to its ethics standards (2008), hosted a national conference on Dance/Movement Therapy in a Diverse Society (2008), and initiated a Board of Directors ad hoc committee to investigate diversity barriers within the organization and profession (2008). The dance/movement therapy (DMT) literature that currently exists in the area of diversity or cultural competence, is a growing but limited body of scholarship that primarily addresses Black Americans (Alexander, 1995; Cherry, 1998; Crapps, 1990; Fountaine, 1982; Harmon, 1994; Saint James, 2006); cultural concerns in practice (Boas, 2006; Chang, 2006; Farr, 1997; Pallaro, 1997), movement observation (Moore & Yamamoto, 1988; Tepayayone, 2004), and several master's theses which address culture specific practice models (Davis, 1993; James, 2006; Madrigal, 2002). The DMT literature has developed largely without reference to the broader, foundational or recent body of MCC literature burgeoning in family therapy, counseling, and psychology in the past ten years. At the same time, there exists a gap in the overall MCC literature, as it is written primarily for therapists who use a verbal medium. For the purpose of this study, the researcher has elected to review body image and nonverbal communication literatures, commonly referenced within DMT, in relation to literature addressing the therapeutic movement relationship and multicultural counseling literature to assist in understanding the cross racial/cultural DMT relationship.